

8 DCNE2005/1352/F - CONVERSION OF BARNs TO ONE DWELLING IN SUPPORT OF AGRICULTURAL HOLDING AT UPPER HOUSE BARNs, PUTLEY, HEREFORDSHIRE. HR8 2QR

For: Messrs D J Pardoe per Mr N J Teale, Brambles Farm, Naunton, Upton-upon-Severn, Worcestershire WR8 0PZ

Date Received:

27th April 2005

Expiry Date:

22nd June 2005

Local Member: Councillor R Manning

Ward:

Frome

Grid Ref:

64053, 37215

1. Site Description and Proposal

- 1.1 This application seeks to convert an agricultural building to a dwelling to be occupied in connection with an existing agricultural holding at Upper House, Putley.
- 1.2 The buildings form part of a larger group. They are near Upper House, of a relatively modern construction, probably dating from the mid 20th century, and have a utilitarian appearance. Internally they are constructed from sawn timbers and do not have any particular architectural features. The single storey part sits hard against the roadside with an internal yard created by buildings which surround. The two-storey element abuts the road with a gable end and forms the southern boundary of the site.
- 1.3 The proposal shows a weatherboarded finish under a slate roof. The inward facing elevation of the single storey part is to be fully glazed and four openings onto the road. It demonstrates 4-bed accommodation with a floor area of approximately 185m².

2. Policies

Hereford and Worcester County Structure Plan

H20 – Housing in rural areas outside the Green Belt (points b & d)

CTC13 – Conversion of buildings

CTC14 – Conversion of buildings

Malvern Hills District Local Plan

Housing Policy 4 – Development in the countryside

Housing Policy 5 – Dwellings for agricultural and forestry workers

Conservation Policy 12 – Residential conversion of agricultural and other rural buildings

Herefordshire Unitary Development Plan (Revised Deposit Draft)

H7 – Housing in the countryside outside settlements
H8 – Agricultural and forestry dwellings and dwellings associated with rural buildings
HBA12 – Re-use of rural buildings
HBA13 – Re-use of rural buildings for residential purposes

Other Policy

PPS 7 – Sustainable development in rural areas

3. Planning History

NE01/3221/F - Change of use from timber barn to private dwelling - Withdrawn.

NE02/0618/F - Change of use of timber barn to form private dwelling - Refused 15 April 2002.

NE05/0119/F - Conversion of barns to one dwelling in support of agricultural holding - Refused under the scheme of delegation 16 February 2005.

4. Consultation SummaryStatutory Consultations

4.1 None required.

Internal Council Consultations

4.2 Transportation Manager - No objection.

5. Representations

5.1 Putley Parish Council - Recommend approval of the application.

5.2 CPRE - Object to the proposal. In our view the barns are not worthy of conversion and cannot see a clear cut business case for a second residence.

5.3 The full text of these letters can be inspected at Northern Planning Services, Blueschool House, Blueschool Street, Hereford and prior to the Sub-Committee meeting.

6. Officers Appraisal

6.1 The application seeks planning permission for the conversion of barns to a single dwelling in support of the existing agricultural holding at Upper House Barns, Putley.

The barns in question have been subject to previous applications for conversion to private residential use. The first such application was withdrawn largely as a result of the response of the Historic Buildings Officer, who concluded that the barns did not merit conversion to residential re-use.

The second application was refused for the same reason, although a note was attached to the decision notice stated that the Local Planning Authority would be prepared to consider a suitable business re-use subject to the amenities of neighbouring dwellings not being adversely affected.

- 6.2 A further application was submitted earlier this year stating a case of agricultural need but this too was refused as your officers were not satisfied that the functional and financial requirements of PPS 7 were satisfied.
- 6.3 It is proposed that Mr J Pardoe, as a partner in the existing agricultural holding would occupy the barns should permission be forthcoming. It is understood that Mr Pardoe's brother occupies the existing dwelling on site and that Mr J Pardoe currently lives some 12 miles away in Hereford.
- 6.4 The agricultural appraisal submitted in connection with the application states that the proposal is in full accordance with both the financial and functional tests as set out under Annex A of PPS7. It is put forward that the conversion is a sustainable re-use of a redundant agricultural building, that would enable the provision of accommodation on the holding without recourse to the erection of a new build. It therefore concludes that there is a need for a dwelling to serve the enterprise. It advises that it generates 1260 man hours per annum, enough to occupy four full time workers and that on site supervision is necessary to successfully increase output.
- 6.5 The application raises two principal issues. Whether the agricultural appraisal provides sufficient evidence to warrant the creation of a dwelling to serve the organic fruit farming enterprise and; if it does, whether this outweighs the previous reason for refusal that the building is not worthy of residential conversion.
- 6.6 The main thrust of the appraisal appears to be that the enterprise generates sufficient man-hours to warrant the creation of a dwelling. However, it gives no detail as to why an individual is required to be permanently resident on the land, nor does it explain why any such needs are not adequately met by an existing dwelling on the holding which is already occupied by one of the partners in the business. It must therefore be concluded that there is insufficient justification for the establishment of a second dwelling on the holding.
- 6.7 On this basis there is no justification to override the previous reason for refusal that the building is of insufficient historic and architectural quality to warrant conversion to residential use. Accordingly the application is recommended for refusal.

RECOMMENDATION

That planning permission be refused for the following reasons:

- 1 - The proposal constitutes the creation of a new dwelling in the open countryside and is therefore contrary to Housing Policy 4 of the Malvern Hills District Local Plan and Policy H20 of the Hereford and Worcester County Structure Plan. The applicant has failed to demonstrate to the satisfaction of the local planning authority that exceptional circumstances exist to override these policies.**

- 2 - The proposal is contrary to Policy H20 of the Hereford and Worcester County Structure Plan and Housing Policy 4 and Conservation Policy 12 of the Malvern Hills District Local Plan in that the buildings are not considered to be of significant historic and architectural quality to warrant retention and conversion to residential use.

Decision:

Notes:

.....

Background Papers

Internal departmental consultation replies.